THE IMPLEMENTATION OF GRAMMAR TRANSLATION METHOD (GTM) AND COMMUNICATIVE LANGUAGE TEACHING (CLT) IN TEACHING INTEGRATED ENGLISH

Hari Prastyo
harrylinguist@yahoo.com

Language Center of Islamic Institut of Uluwiyah Mojokerto, Indonesia
Jalan Raya Mojosari Mojokerto KM. 4 No. 10 Mojokerto

Abstract: Fluency and accuracy are the target of learning English. Both of them have important role for the students who learn English. Consequently, a teacher should consider fluency and accuracy of the English used by the students in the classroom. It means that teaching English should teach both linguistics and communicative competence. To teach linguistics competence, a teacher can use Grammar Translation Method (GTM). Furthermore, a teacher needs Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) Method to teach communicative competence. This article will study about the “The Implementation of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) and Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) Method in Teaching Integrated English” which are applied in Basic English Station (BEST) Course of Jombang. This English course can combine both GTM and CLT to teach the students. For the first time, the writer will discuss about GTM and CLT theory. Then he will describe the programs and the materials applied in this course. Afterward, the writer will discuss about the implementation of GTM and CLT which are used to explain the materials and how GTM and CLT are applied in the programs that this course has. It means that, GTM and CLT will be applied both in the classroom and the programs of this English course.

Keywords-Grammar Translation Method, Communicative Language Teaching, Basic English Station Course

INTRODUCTION

Fluency and accuracy are the target of learning English, both of them are very important for the students in learning second or foreign language. Consequently, a teacher should teach the students by using a method that can be used to achieve the target of
accuracy and fluency. CLT is one of methods in language teaching that emphasizes on communicative in teaching English. This kind of method focuses on building communicative competence of the students. It is a type of students’ competence to use the language that they learn in the classroom for meaningful communication. This idea is supported by Richards (2006:3), he said that

“.... it is clearly not all that is involved in learning a language since one can master the rules of sentence formation in a language and still not be very successful at being able to use the language for meaningful communication. It is the latter capacity which is understood by the term communicative competence.”

However, linguistics competence is also useful for the students, because it helps students to form sentences correctly. This competence focuses on building sentences, such as understanding part of speech, tenses in active and passive, and conditional sentence. It means that in linguistics competence, the students should be able to understand part of speech and to make sentences correctly.

However, both the competences are needed by the students. They cannot be separated each other, because one method completes another. Therefore, it is very important to use method(s) that can achieve both communicative and linguistics competence.

This article will discuss about the way to achieve both competence in teaching English Course at Jombang East Java Indonesia. It will cover GTM and CLT theory as review of related literature and the previous study. Then he will describe the programs and the materials applied in this English Course. Afterward, the writer will discuss about the implementation of GTM and CLT which are used to explain the materials and how GTM and CLT are applied in the programs that this course have. It means that, GTM and CLT will be applied both in the classroom and the programs of this English course.

A study of GTM and CLT had been done by Shih-Chuan Chang from Cheng Shiu University of Taiwan. The researcher compared Grammar Translation method and Communicative Approach in teaching English Grammar. The result of the research showed that grammar teaching in the framework of the Grammar Translation Method is better than Communicative Approach. It means that teaching grammar is better to use Grammar Translation Method (GTM). Furthermore, teaching grammar focuses on accuracy. Based on the research, we can understand that Grammar Translation Method (GTM) will achieve accuracy of learning English. In addition, Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) will
achieve fluency of learning English. This research showed that both GTM and CLT have important role in learning English, but they have different function.

**Grammar Translation Method (GTM)**

Grammar translation method that is also called classical method is a method of teaching English that uses translation of the implementation. The main characteristic of this method is that this method focuses on learning the rule of the grammar (sentence structure) and the implementation of it in translating passage from one language to another language. In another word, a teacher who teaches English by using GTM will teach the grammar. Furthermore, the teacher uses grammar to teach the students by translating one language to another language.

This kind of method is assumed that it can make the students bored in the classroom, because a teacher who uses GTM in teaching English will present the language structure in front of the classroom. Furthermore, the students just listen and take a note from the explanation of the teacher. It means that GTM can create the domination of the teacher in the classroom. In other words, the class activity will more focus on the rule of the language structure than practice the rule itself.

In addition, GTM cannot develop the students’ communicative competence, because they cannot use the rule of the language structure flexibly to communicate. Consequently, some teachers leave this method and move into another method that can develop the communicative competence of the students.

However, Grammar Translation method still has the advantage for language teaching and learning, especially in term of accuracy. Learning English accurately is very important, especially for reading, because it can help the students to understand the construct of sentence in a text. This condition can help the students to understand a text through the identification of sentence, such as part of speech, noun determiner, tenses, etc. This condition can help the students to comprehend a text easily, because learning English means learning to read.

This idea is supported by Zainudin (2011:64), he said that reading is also a goal for learning language. It means that learning language is not only for communicating, but also for reading. By mastering the grammar through Grammar Translation Method, the students can read and understand a text easily by identifying the structure of sentence in a text.

According to Celce Murcia (1979:3) there are eight characteristics of this method that the writer will mention as follows:
1. Classes are taught in the first language, with little active use of the target language;
2. Much of the vocabulary is in the form of lists of isolated words;
3. Detail explanation about the structure of grammar is given;
4. Grammar provides the rules for putting words together, and instruction often focuses on the form and the inflection for words;
5. Reading of difficult classical texts in the beginning of the class;
6. Little attention is paid to the content of texts, which are treated as exercises in grammatical analysis;
7. In teaching grammar, it is important to make the language situations and language material as realistic as possible. After explaining the lesson, the teacher can provide a chance for the students to use the language that they learn in the classroom.

Based on the explanation above, we can see that Grammar Translation method is a method that can make the students bored. However, when it is modified, the students can acquire the grammar competence in enjoyable classroom without facing boring situation.

The English Course that the researcher will describe has tried to implement the modified Grammar Translation Method.

**Communicative Language Teaching (CLT)**

When GTM focuses on teaching grammar, then CLT focuses on the language usage. It means that CLT is a method that focuses on how a certain language is used in communication. This idea is supported by Harmer (2007:69), he said that CLT talks about the concept of the language usage. This condition is reflected in our English Curriculum that the English teachers should teach the students some expressions which are used to communicate, such as asking and giving something, asking and giving services, expression of certainty and so on. It is a proof that the English curriculum nowadays is designed based on the CLT method.

Furthermore, a teacher who teaches English by using CLT, it means that the teacher gives a chance for the students to use the language in communication. This condition can help the students to be master in English skill, especially in speaking. Harmer (2007:69) said that one of CLT characteristics is that CLT can create a real communication for the students. Consequently, it will help the teacher to create English environment for the students. As we know that English environment is very important for the learners, especially for EFL students. According to Sarah (the researcher interviewed...
her on September 26th, 2013 at Mayjen Sungkono University, Mojokerto), she is one of the English Teacher Volunteers from USA, practicing English in daily activity is very important. This is the big problem in Indonesia, because the students only listens English in certain condition, such as in classroom, on TV etc, but they do not have chance to use the language in daily activities, even the English teachers sometimes do not speak English with the students. It shows that giving a chance for the students to practice their English is very important thing.

In CLT, teaching English is designed for teaching the content (not the form), such as how to make something or to do something, some expressions, etc. Harmer (2007:70) said that the students, who learn English in communicative way, must have spirit to communicate something. It means that the students must have purpose when they learn English and the purpose is that the content of the language learnt, such as making an agreement, order food etc.

However, it is not easy to ask the students to have conversation each other. Consequently, it is very important to find the way how to support the students in order that they have willingness to use the language that they learnt. One of the way that the teachers can do is by giving “information gap”. This is one of technique that the teachers use to invite the students’ involvement in English communication. Harmer (2007:70) said “a key to the enhancement of communicative purpose and the desire to communicate is the information gap.” This way can be done by giving different information to the students who are involved in language learning. For example, first student is given the question of the position of certain place, and second student is given the map of certain place that first student needs or vice versa.

By creating that condition, communicative classroom will be created and that is one of CLT. It means that a teacher who teaches by using CLT, the teacher teaches English as a function, because CLT emphasizes more on the language usage rather than the structure, although CLT has also structural competence. Richard & Theodoe, 2001: 155) said “...Communicative Language Teaching means little more than an integration of grammatical and functional teaching.”

This kind of method is supported by some scholars from different disciplines, such as Halliday, Hymes, Labov etc. Richard & Theodoe (2001: 153) stated that there were some scholars who supported Communicative Language Teaching, such as Jhon Firth and Halliday form functional linguists, Hymes, Gumperz and Labov from Sociolinguistics, Austin and Searle from philosophy. CLT can provide a real context in teaching English and also it can give information about certain culture. As we know that teaching language
should also teach the culture and the context. According to Richard & Theodoe (2001: 158) stated that language should be taught in culture and context. Furthermore, CLT provide those aspects, culture and context, in teaching language, in this case is teaching English.

It means that teaching English not only teach the structure, but also how language is used in certain condition based on the context and culture of the society. On the contrary, CLT is also called as integrative method because it teaches the language and also the social interaction that uses English as a means of communication. According to Littlewood (1981:86) Communicative Activities covers two things, they are functional communication activities and social interaction activities. Both activities are very important to be implemented in language teaching and learning.

METHOD

The design of this research is a Descriptive Qualitative. This research would like to describe the implementation of GTM and CLT in teaching integrated English for EFL learners at Indonesia, especially at Basic English Station (BEST) Course, Jombang, East Java. This research had been done a year. At that time, the researcher involved in teaching and learning process. During the time, the researcher observed the teaching and learning activity (English for General (EFG) Program. Actually, it had 3 (three) programs, they were English for Children/EFC (it lasted for 3 months), English for General/EFG (it lasted for 6 months), and English for Academic/EFA (it lasted for 3 months). However, the researcher focused only on EFG Program. To observe EFG programs, the researcher used field note technique. The data that the researcher got by using field note was that the technique of language teaching used in teaching and learning process. To ensure the data got, the researcher also used triangulation technique by interviewing teacher about the technique used in the classroom and also interviewed the director. By using this way, the researcher can have been sure that the technique used is the same technique at the same program.

To collect the data, the researcher did the following steps: (1) preparing the interview guides, (2) Preparing observation sheet for doing field note, (3) doing the interview and observation. To analyse the data, the researcher did the following steps: (1) list the data got from field note and interview, (2) analyse the data got based on the Grammar Translation Method and Communicative Language Teaching theory.
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Findings

The Program Implemented at BEST

Based on the field note and interview, the researcher got the following data: (1) the data about the programs that the English course had and the material which were delivered to the students, (2) the data that related to the technique of language teaching. The following was the data presentation.

There were some programs that BEST (It stands for Basic English Station) had, they were English for Children (EFC), English for General (EFG), and English for Academic (EFA). English for Children Program was a program that was designed for children who were at elementary school. They were 9 to 13 years old. This program lasted for 3 months in which a week had 3 or 4 meetings.

Furthermore, English for General (EFG) is the second program that BEST had. This program was designed for junior high school students, senior high school students, and university students. This program consists of three levels, they were BTC (Basic Training Course), CTC (Central Training Course), and TC (Training Course). It needed 6 months to complete all the levels in this program.

Each level had certain materials. The materials of BTC level were Part of Speech, Pronoun, Possessive, Tenses in Active, translation, and conversation. Translation and conversation were two activities that had to be done at each meeting. In this case, the teacher spoke Indonesian Language, and the students translated it into English based on the grammar they learnt in the classroom. Each meeting for this level consisted of 90 minutes. 15 minutes for drilling the students, 30 minutes for explaining the material, and 45 minutes for having conversation. In drilling activity, the teacher asked the students to translate what the teacher said from Indonesian into English based on the materials that had been explained at previous meeting. Then in explaining the material, the teacher started it by giving the pattern of certain tense, after that the teacher gave the example in the form of sentence, and the teacher drilled the students by using the material given. This second activity lasted for 30 minutes. The lasted 45 minutes, the students were asked to have conversation with the partner that they chose by themselves. It means that they were free to choose partner, in order that they could express their mind freely. In this level, both the students and teacher sometimes used English in the classroom. This level lasted for 1 month.

In addition, the materials of CTC level were Tenses in Passive, Degree of Comparison, Command and Request, Conditional Sentence, Tag Question, Reported
Speech, and Full English Training. In this level, the teacher used two languages in explaining and communicating with the students. In the classroom, the teacher used Indonesian and English to explain all the materials. Besides that, the students were a must to speak English although they had finished the class activity. In this case, the students were supported to use the English out of the classroom. In order that this rule did not make burden for the students, they could apply code mixing in their conversation. The most important thing in this level was that the students were brave to use their English in daily activity. Moreover, this level had additional program and activity, they were Meeting Program and Memorizing Drilling Concept. Meeting Program was a program that gave the students to practice their English in the real social context. In this program, the students got duty to be MC, reader of Holy Quran, Translator, and speakers. For those who became speakers, they had to present their idea in front of the audiences by using English. Besides that, the audiences gave questions based on the topic presented. The second program in this level was that Memorizing Drilling Concept, it was a compilation of recount text that the students had to memorize in front of the classroom. After memorizing it, the students were asked to make conversation based on the drilling concept they memorized. This level lasted for 2 months.

Additionally, TC level materials were full of English Communication, Adjective Clause, Discussion and it would be completed with spoken test in which the students had to practice to have communication with the foreigners. Additionally, in this level, the teacher used full English in explaining the materials, besides that the students also used English in daily activity, especially in the classroom, or in anywhere when they were in the English course area, such as in parking area and in the waiting room. In another word, the students who could reach this level, they had to be able to create the English environment to support their skill, especially in speaking. The program that was held by this level was Cycling and Selective New Chief of Meeting Program. It was a kind of outdoor activity that was used not only to practice their English, but also to refresh the students’ mind. This level lasted for 3 months, the test was included in the three months.

The last program that BEST had was English for Academic (EFA) Program. This program was designed for the students who had been completed EFG Program and students would like to be master in Academic English, such as texts type and some expression. However, in this research, the researcher just focused on English for General (EFG) Program.

The materials given during the teaching and learning process are Part of Speech, Pronoun, Possessive, Tenses in Active, Tenses in Passive, Degree of Comparison,
Command and Request, Conditional Sentence, Tag Question, Reported Speech, and Adjective Clause.

The next data that the researcher got was that related to teaching techniques. The teaching techniques used during the teaching and learning process were (1) at the first level (BTC level), the teachers used first or second language (Javanese and Indonesian), (2) at all levels, teachers explained the structure of certain grammar that relate to the material at that time, (3) besides teaching grammar, the teachers also gave list of vocabularies while they were teaching grammar, (4) the teachers drilled the students to use certain grammar, (5) at the end of the classroom (about 45 minutes before the class finished), the students are asked to practice in pair the language that they learnt that day, (6) before practicing, the teachers gave a model for the students in order that the students could understand the instruction clearly and they could have spirit, because they had known what they would like to do in front of the classroom, (7) in practicing, the students were asked to have conversation based on the language used in daily activity, such as asking subject, asking object, asking time, place, etc. When the researcher interviewed one of the teacher there, the respondent for the teacher was Mrs. Indah, she told the researcher that she used the same techniques as the researcher used. Besides to the teacher, the researcher also interviewed the director, he asked about the technique implemented in this English course. According to Mr Budi, as the director, all the teachers there were asked to use the same technique in teaching and learning process and it was a must for the teachers to implement those techniques.

Furthermore, based on the observation, the researcher also found that this English course did some activities, such as memorizing Drilling Concept, Meeting activity, Cycling and Selective New Chief of Meeting Program.

Discussions

Based on the data above, the researcher would like to classify the techniques used in teaching and learning process as follow:

Table 1: the method used in Basic English Station (BEST) as the English Course

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>GTM</th>
<th>CLT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the teachers used first or second language (Javanese and Indonesian)</td>
<td>the students are asked to practice in pair the language</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that they learnt that day

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Description</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teachers explained the structure of certain grammar</td>
<td>Meeting activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers gave a model for the students</td>
<td>Cycling and Selective New Chief of Meeting Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers also gave lists of vocabularies</td>
<td>To have conversation based on drilling concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers drilled the students to use certain grammar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the table above, we can see that the English course implements Grammar Translation Method (GTM) and Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) both in the classroom and outdoor activity.

The first technique to present the material used by the teacher was that the teachers used first or second language (Javanese and Indonesian) when they explained the material at the first level (BTC Level). It is the first characteristic of GTM technique proposed by Prato and Celce Murcia (1979:3), because the teachers spoke Indonesian and even Javanese rather than English as the target language. Actually, the teachers also used target language, but they used Indonesian and Javanese frequently. It was done because the students at this level were still basic; they did not have more language input in their society.

The second technique used by the teachers was that to explain the structure of certain language. It is also the characteristic of GTM, because the language teaching and learning focuses more on the pattern rather than communication. In this technique, the teacher explained the structure of English sentences, both in active and passive form. The teachers explained how to construct the correct sentence.

List of vocabularies were also given to the students. This is one of the characteristic of GTM, because at this activity, the teachers made a list of verb, adjective, or noun for the students and those verbs were used to practice the pattern of sentence that the students learnt. Teaching grammar and vocab at the same time is a good way for students because it can help them to practice what they learnt in the classroom by using grammar and vocab they got. According to Phillips (1995:74), he said “both vocabulary and grammar need to
be taught in context and the children should always be given plenty of opportunities to use the language that they have learned in class”. This way is the combination of GTM and CLT, because the teachers did not only give vocabularies list, but also gave opportunities for the students to practice the language at the end of the classroom activity. The students were asked to practice in pair. It is the characteristic of CLT. By combining this activity, the students not only can create correct sentence, but also they can use the language for daily conversation.

Before being given a chance to practice, the teacher stimulated the students by using two activities; they are drilling technique and giving a model. The purpose of drilling was that to stimulate the students in using the target language based on the pattern and vocabularies given. Besides that, this technique was used to ensure that the students understand the material given. While giving a model is one of activity to give scaffolding for the students before they practice. This scaffolding was very important for the students, because the students can see directly what they would do/practice in front of the classroom.

Memorizing drilling concept was also type of GTM. In this activity, the students were given a text that relates to the grammar they learnt, and they memorized the text in front of the classroom. However, the students not only memorize the text, but also they practiced to have conversation based on the text they memorized. This is also a combination of GTM and CLT, because in memorizing, the students got input about the grammar and vocab, while in having conversation, the students got a chance to practice the grammar and vocab they got in drilling concept. Both activities were useful for the students in building the knowledge of grammar and confidence of the students to speak in front of the classroom.

Additionally, Basic English Station (BEST) also had outdoor activity that was Cycling and Selective New Chief of Meeting Program. They were kind of programs which were done to refresh the students’ mind and to give the students a chance to express their mind. Those activities were done once three months. There were many activities that the students should do, they were fun bike, practicing to be MC, giving speech and some performances. During those activities, the students had to speak English. When they needed a help, they should ask a help to their friends by using English, that was a learning model that could create English environment for the students. Consequently, the researcher calls it as Communicative Language Teaching.

Relate to Cycling and Selective New Chief of Meeting Program, Basic English Station (BEST) also had program namely Meeting Program. This program was done once two weeks. In this program, all the students had to speak English. There were some
students who got duty as MC, English translator, speakers to give speech, and other students had pay attention to the speakers. After the speakers gave speech, the other students should give certain question that relate to the topic of the speakers. Consequently, the students always got a chance to practice their language, because this activity was done once two weeks. This kind of activity was very important for the students to build the confidence of students when they spoke in front of the public.

To make clear the explanation above, look at the figure below:

![Figure 1: the combination of GTM and CLT in Teaching and Learning Process](image)

Based on the figure above, it can be seen that both of GTM and CLT are useful for language teaching and learning, because each method has different target – accuracy and fluency – and both of the targets are needed by the students.

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTION

Finally, it can be concluded that discussing about GTM and CLT means that we do not discuss about better and worse method, but we discuss about the different target of each method. GTM target is accuracy, and CLT target is fluency. It is very important to combine both accuracy and fluency. Furthermore, Basic English Station (BEST) as the English course is the institution in Indonesia that has implemented those two methods – through material and activity – to get accuracy and fluency in English for their students.

It is suggested for the next researchers to have research by combining those two methods in teaching and learning. The next researchers can use Research and Development Design to develop material based on those two methods. Furthermore, the next researchers also can use these two methods in Classroom Action Research Design.
REFERENCES


Contributor’s Biodata

**Hari Prastyo** was the researcher born on Jombang, August 15th, 1986. He finished his undergraduate program at “Maulana Malik Ibrahim” State Islamic University of Malang on 2008. In addition, on 2012 he got his Magister Degree in English Education at Islamic University of Malang. At 2013, he presented his first paper at the international conference on English Linguistics and Literature. The next year (2014), he presented his second paper at National Conference of 6th NELTAL. Then at the same year, he presented his paper at 61th TEFLIN International Conference about Need Analysis on Academic Writing. A few days after that (2014), he also presented his article about readability and discourse quality at 2nd ELITE International Conference. On 2015, he was invited as parrarel speaker at the International Conference on Language, Culture and Society held by Indonesian Institute of Sciences-LIPI Jakarta).