

A Review of Gadamer's Hermeneutics of Syuhudi Ismail's Concept of Hadith Contextualization

Raadliyatush Shalihah

STIT Al-Ishlah Bondowoso

Email: raadliyatush.shalihah@gmail.com

Muhammad Habibi Hamzah

STIT Al-Ishlah Bondowoso

Email: shamela141189@gmail.com

Abstract

Syuhudi Ismail is an Indonesian hadith scholar who has a new concept in understanding hadith, namely by contextualizing hadith and characterizing hadith with temporal, local and universal. In this study, the concept of contextualization of hadith of Syuhudi Ismail is reviewed hermeneutically from Gadamer's hermeneutic theory. The purpose of this research is to find out Syuhudi Ismail's concept in contextualizing hadith and to review it with Gadamer's hermeneutic theory. This study uses library research method by referring to books by Syuhudi Ismail especially Syuhudi Ismail's book entitled Textual and Contextual Hadith and scientific articles that discuss the work of Syuhudi Ismail in contextualizing hadith as well as scientific articles about Gadamer's hermeneutics and examples of its application. In Gadamer's hermeneutics there are aspects that need to be considered and these aspects are reviewed from the contextual interpretation of Syuhudi Ismail's hadith so that both involve socio-historical, contextual aspects and fuse the two so as to give birth to a relative new meaning. As in the interpretation of the Hadith about the threat to painters, Syuhudi Ismail interprets the Hadith by presenting the socio-historical aspect which is used as the 'illat of the Hadith which if the 'illat of this Hadith is lost, it will affect the meaning of the Hadith.

Keywords: Hadith, Contextualization, Syuhudi Ismail, Gadamer

Abstrak

Syuhudi Ismail adalah seorang ulama hadits Indonesia yang memiliki konsep baru dalam memahami hadits, yaitu dengan mengkontekstualisasikan hadits serta mengklasifikasikan hadits menjadi bersifat temporal, lokal, dan universal. Dalam kajian ini, konsep kontekstualisasi hadits dari Syuhudi Ismail dikaji secara hermeneutik dengan menggunakan teori hermeneutika dari Hans-Georg Gadamer. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui konsep kontekstualisasi hadits menurut Syuhudi Ismail dan mengkajinya melalui teori hermeneutika Gadamer. Penelitian ini

menggunakan metode studi pustaka dengan merujuk pada buku-buku karya Syuhudi Ismail, khususnya bukunya yang berjudul *Hadis Nabi Antara Teks dan Konteks*, serta artikel ilmiah yang membahas karya Syuhudi Ismail dalam mengkontekstualisasikan hadits, dan juga artikel ilmiah mengenai hermeneutika Gadamer serta contoh penerapannya. Dalam hermeneutika Gadamer, terdapat aspek-aspek yang perlu diperhatikan, dan aspek-aspek ini dikaji dari penafsiran kontekstual hadits oleh Syuhudi Ismail sehingga keduanya melibatkan aspek sosial-historis dan kontekstual serta meleburkan keduanya hingga melahirkan makna yang relatif baru. Seperti dalam penafsiran hadits mengenai ancaman terhadap pelukis, Syuhudi Ismail menafsirkan hadits tersebut dengan menghadirkan aspek sosial-historis yang dijadikan sebagai ‘illat dari hadits, yang mana apabila ‘illat dari hadits ini telah hilang, maka akan berpengaruh terhadap makna dari hadits tersebut.

Kata kunci: Hadits, Kontekstualisasi, Syuhudi Ismail, Gadamer

Introduction

Historically, scholars in the archipelago, especially in Indonesia, initially only read and taught Hadith books without conducting studies and examining the validity of their sanad and matan. They assumed that the ijtihad of the previous scholars was finalized, so there was no need for the current scholars to examine the validity of a hadith. This assumption continued until one of Muhammad Rashid Ridha's companions and students, Muhammad Thaher ibn Muhammad Jalal al-Din al-Azhari returned to Indonesia. He then published the magazine “al-Imam”, which became the starting point of an influential thought on the study of Hadith in the archipelago.¹

The development of hadith studies in the archipelago gave birth to many modern hadith scholars, one of whom is Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail. As an Indonesian Muslim historian, Syuhudi Ismail made many scientific contributions, especially in the scope of hadith science by writing several famous works and modern thoughts on hadith which are widely used as studies in contemporary hadith learning. Ismail's works are widely utilized in the academic environment, shaping the curriculum of hadith studies in Indonesia.²

¹ Umar Hadi Umar, ‘REKONSTRUKSI PEMIKIRAN HERMENEUTIKA HADIS SYUHUDI ISMAIL’, *PAPPASANG* 4, no. 1 (30 June 2022): 1–24, <https://doi.org/10.46870/jiat.v4i1.166>.

² Kanti Pertiwi and Teguh Wijaya Mulya, ‘Mistresses, Mothers, and Headscarves: Media Representations of Women in Corruption Scandals in Indonesia’, *Feminist Media Studies* 23, no. 5 (4 July 2023): 2135–51, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14680777.2022.2042832>.

Syuhudi Ismail in his thought has given a very large scope for *ijtihad* to understand hadith. In every condition, situation, and place, humans have various similarities. On the other hand, humans are also filled with differences. This is based on the existence of time and place. Syuhudi Ismail argues that the situation experienced today is different from the situation during the prophetic era. He offers a concept of textual and contextual hadith in the study of hadith. The concept of Syuhudi Ismail is somewhat different from the thinking of the majority of classical hadith experts who severely limit *ijtihad*. Therefore, researchers are interested in studying the concept. This article will discuss Syuhudi Ismail's thoughts that are very influential on hadith studies. Especially in the scope of textual and contextual hadith.³

The importance of hadith contextualization lies in its ability to bridge historical teachings with the needs of contemporary society, ensuring that Islamic principles remain relevant and applicable. Contextualization enables a nuanced understanding of the hadith, which is essential for addressing modern issues such as religious tolerance, marriage practices, and social justice. This approach fosters a more inclusive interpretation of Islamic teachings, promoting harmony in a diverse society.⁴ This need for contextualization is underscored by various methodologies, including hermeneutics, which facilitate a deeper understanding of the hadith in light of current realities.⁵

The contextualization of the meaning of hadith produced by Syuhudi Ismail has a connection with hermeneutic theory, especially Gadamer's hermeneutic theory. In his hermeneutic theory, Gadamer emphasizes the historical aspect of understanding while stressing the importance of language, then used to analyze the development of hermeneutic circles towards philosophical awareness in the human sciences. To show that understanding is interpretative, Gadamer uses the phenomenological concept of Fusion of Horizon, welding of horizons (the fusion of two kinds of horizons or horizons).⁶

³ Dayan Fithoroini and Muhammad Latif Mukti, 'HADIS NABI YANG TEKSTUAL DAN KONTEKSTUAL', *NABAWI* 2 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.55987/njhs.v2i1.42>.

⁴ Alkadri Alkadri, Zarul Arifin, and Harles Anwar, 'Contextualization of Hadith about Tolerance for Religious and Cultural Diversity', *AL QUDS: Jurnal Studi Alquran Dan Hadis* 7, no. 1 (9 May 2023): 95, <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v7i1.5744>.

⁵ Suryani Suryani, 'Urgensi Hermeneutika Sebagai Metode Dalam Pemahaman Hadis', *AL QUDS: Jurnal Studi Alquran dan Hadis* 6, no. 2 (6 September 2022): 779, <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v6i2.4086>.

⁶ Muh Ilham R Kurniawan, 'PENGAPLIKASIAN TEORI HERMENEUTIKA HANS-GEORG GADAMER TERHADAP HADIS NABI MUHAMMAD', n.d.

In contrast to Schleimacher's hermeneutics which focuses on the space and time gap between the text, the author and the reader to be able to interpret the text objectively and regardless of the author's intention, Gadamer emphasizes the dialectic between text and context so as to produce a more dynamic interpretation of the text.⁷

In connection with this research, there are several studies that also discuss the concept of contextualization of hadith by Syuhudi Ismail such as research entitled 'Textual and contextual Hadith of the Prophet by Fithoroini and Mukti, Syuhudi Ismail's thoughts on textual and contextual hadith by Nur'aini, Analysis of Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail's hermeneutic thought by Rifa'i but from some of these studies no one has discussed the contextualization of Syuhudi Ismail's hadith in terms of Gadamer's hermeneutic theory.

Method

This research uses a qualitative method and the data collection uses a literature study. The discussion in this research uses Gadamer's hermeneutics as an approach. At the beginning of the discussion, it will be presented about Syuhudi Ismail's biography, his works and the concept of contextualization of hadith referred from one of his works entitled 'Textual and Contextual Prophetic Hadith and from the primary hadith books as a reference to the hadith examples mentioned by Syuhudi Ismail in his book. As for Gadamer's hermeneutics, the author searches for articles that discuss similar matters

Biography of M. Syuhudi Ismail

Syuhudi Ismail was born on April 23, 1943, in the Rowo Kangkung area, Lumajang Regency, East Java. Syuhudi Ismail is the second child of H. Ismail's marriage with Sufiyatun. H. Ismail bin Mistin bin Soemoharjo is someone who has madura blood, while Sufiyatun binti Ja'far is a native Javanese woman. Little Syuhudi spent a lot of his time in studying, even though it was the same as children in general, namely playing, but his time was more focused on studying the world and the hereafter. In the morning, Syuhudi spent his time studying at the Folk School in Sidorejo, Lumajang. In the afternoons, he spent his time learning the Koran from his father. Syuhudi Ismail also studied religion with Kiai Manshur, who came from a boarding school in Jember. It was his father who directly asked Kiai Manshur to come teach little Syuhudi Ismail.⁸

⁷ Ilyas Supena, 'Gadamer's Philosophical Hermeneutics on Religious Language and COVID-19', *Filosofija. Sociologija* 33, no. 3 (13 September 2022), <https://doi.org/10.6001/fil-soc.v33i3.4780>.

⁸ Fithoroini and Mukti, 'HADIS NABI YANG TEKSTUAL DAN KONTEKSTUAL'.

Syuhudi Ismail began his formal education from Sidorejo Public School for 12 years. Then continued to the State Religious Teacher Education (PGAN) school. Not stopping there, Syuhudi Ismail continued his education to the next level, namely the Yogyakarta State Islamic Judge Education. Then after completing the education period from PHIN Yogyakarta, Syuhudi Ismail was selected as a Civil Servant at the Ujungpandang Religious Court, South Sulawesi. Even though Syuhudi Ismail was elected as a Civil Servant whose duties were many and filled with community activities, Syuhudi Ismail did not stop his enthusiasm in studying. Syuhudi Ismail then continued his education in 1965 at IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Makasaar branch which is now IAIN Alauddin. Then in 1982, Syuhudi Ismail continued his education by participating in the Masters and Doctoral Postgraduate Program at IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta for 3 years until 1985. Then in 1987, Syuhudi continued his education at the PH.d level and obtained the best PH.d degree in the field of Islamic studies with a concentration in Hadith Science.⁹

Syuhudi Ismail passed away at Cipto Mangunkusumo Hospital Jakarta on November 19, 1995 and was buried on November 20, 1995 at the Bontoala Islamic Cemetery in Ujungpandang, South Sulawesi.

Syuhudi Ismail was a prolific writer. Many works have been realized in books, namely, Textual and Contextual Prophetic Hadiths: A Ma'ani al-Hadis Study of Universal, Temporal, and Local Islamic Teachings, Practical Ways of Finding Hadith, Hadith Sanad Authenticity Rules Critical Analysis and Review with a Historical Science Approach, Introduction to Hadith Science, Prophetic Hadith Research Methodology.¹⁰

Syuhudi Ismail's Concept of Hadith Contextualization

Syuhudi Ismail wrote a book that specifically discusses the concept of contextualization of hadith and categorizes them into temporal, local and global hadith. This grouping is one of the hadith contextualization concepts embedded in some of the traditions exemplified in his book. In discussing the meaning of the traditions written, Syuhudi Ismail does three things, namely first discussing the textual meaning of the hadith, second presenting the background of the hadith, third characterizing the traditions mentioned as temporal, local and universal.¹¹(Syuhudi, 2009:9)

⁹ Surur Rifai, Moh. Syafik R, and Masruhan Masruhan, 'Analisis Pemikiran Hermeneutika Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail', *CENDEKIA: Jurnal Studi Keislaman* 8, no. 2 (2 February 2023): 227–44, <https://doi.org/10.37348/cendekia.v8i2.210>.

¹⁰ Siti Nur'aini, 'Pemikiran Syuhudi Ismail tentang Hadis Tekstual dan Kontekstual', *Cendekia Inovatif Dan Berbudaya* 1, no. 1 (12 June 2023): 1–6, <https://doi.org/10.59996/cendib.v1i1.145>.

¹¹ Syuhudi Ismail, *Hadis Nabi yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual*. (Jakarta PT. Bulan Bintang, 2009). 9

The book of Textual and Contextual Prophetic Hadith by Syuhudi Ismail is divided into several chapters, namely:

First: About the Form of the Matan of the Prophetic Hadith and the Scope of its Instructions which consists of the chapter Jawami' Kalim, the chapter of Tamsil Language, the chapter of Symbolic Expressions, the chapter of Conversational Language, the chapter of Analogy Expressions.

Second: Hadith Content in Relation to the Function of the Prophet Muhammad

Third : Prophetic Hadiths in Relation to the Background of Their Occurrence, which consists of chapters on Hadiths that Do Not Have a Specific Cause, chapters on Hadiths that Have a Specific Cause, chapters on Hadiths Relating to the Current Situation.

Fourth: Hints of Prophetic Hadiths that Seem to Contradict Each Other.

The conclusion of Syuhudi Ismail's work is that there are several characters of hadith matan that can be used as a basis that an existing hadith must be understood textually and contextually which will have implications for the teaching content of the hadith, namely there are universal, temporal, and local.

a. Textual Hadith

1) Textual-Universal

According to Syuhudi, a hadith should be understood textually if the hadith, after being related to its related aspects, such as the background of its occurrence, still demands an understanding in accordance with what is written in the text of the hadith.

An example of this is the Hadith in the form of Jawami'ul Kalim.

عن عائشة رضي الله عنها عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: «الرَّضَاعَةُ تَحْرِمُ مَا تَحْرِمُ الْوِلَادَةُ.»

“A'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) reported that the Prophet (may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him) said: “Breastfeeding is as forbidding as birth.” (HR Bukhari)

In explaining the above Hadith, Syuhudi Ismail writes that the Hadith is an explanation of the Qur'anic provision in Surah An Nisa' verse 23 and the Hadith is a Prophetic Hadith in the form of Jawami'ul Kalim so it needs to be understood textually and shows part of the Universal teachings of Islam. From Syuhudi Ismail's explanation, the Hadith about the mahram of breastfeeding is

a textual and universal Hadith so that the meaning of the Hadith is suitable for all circumstances and times.

2) Textual-Temporal

There are also textual traditions in the form of jawami'ul kalim that are temporal for certain reasons that refer, for example, to the wisdom of da'wah. For example, the interpretation of the hadith of the Prophet

عن ابن عمر رضي الله عنهما قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: «كل مُسْكِرٍ خَمْرٌ، وكل مُسْكِرٍ حرام، ومن شرب الخمر في الدنيا فمات وهو يُدْمِنُهَا لَمْ يَتُوبْ، لَمْ يَشْرَبْهَا فِي الْآخِرَةِ.»

Ibn 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) reported: The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said: "Every intoxicant is wine and every intoxicant is forbidden. Whoever drinks alcohol in this world and then dies as an alcoholic and has not repented, he will not get it in the Hereafter." (HR Bukhari)

According to Shuhudi, the prohibition in the Hadith is textual in nature, i.e., the instructions regarding the prohibition of alcohol are not bound to a specific time and place. However, when it comes to policy or proselytization, the Hadith can be characterized as a temporal Hadith that aims to provide relief for certain people who have just converted to Islam. So it is temporarily permissible but he should try to make sure to stop drinking as a process of implementing the prohibition of alcohol.

b. Contextual Hadiths

1) Contextual-Twil-Universal

Contextual understanding and application of hadith can be done when there is a strong indication behind a hadith that requires the hadith to be understood and applied other than its explicit meaning.

According to Syuhudi Ismail the traditions that can be understood contextually when related to the nature of the text are usually when the text of the tradition is expressed in a symbolic language style.

A case in point is those that speak of God's "descent" to the heavens of the world..

ينزل ربنا تبارك وتعالى إبل السماء الدنيا كل ليلة حني يبقى ثلث الليل الآخر فيقول: من يدعوين فأستجيب له، من يسألين فأعطيه، من يستغفرين فأغفر له، حنت ينفجر الفجر

“Our Lord Tabarakawata’ala descends to the heavens of the world every final third of the night. God then says: ‘Whoever prays, I will grant. Whoever asks Me, I will give. Whoever asks Me for forgiveness, I will forgive. Until dawn breaks’”(HR.Bukhari1145,Muslim758).

Syuhudi Ismail interprets the above Hadīth to mean that Allah descends to the heavens of the world, meaning the abundance of His mercy. Not with the textual meaning of descending in the ordinary sense because that would equate Allah with creatures. Because with a textual understanding of the Hadith, it is said that the Hadith is dhaif or even maudhu'. This problem can be solved through contextual interpretation, aka takwil.¹²

The above Hadith, in the discipline of aqidah, is called an attribute Hadith, which is a Hadith that talks about the attributes of Allah. Regarding the verses or traditions of attributes there are different attitudes and interpretations of the scholars in interpreting it. On the one hand there are those who are isbat (meaning that it is understood textually), but the kaifiyat is interpreted, and on the other hand there are also scholars who interpret it.¹³

From the above case it can also be concluded that what Syuhudi meant by the term contextual in his work besides being interpreted as contextualization with reality (for example in the hadith about breastfeeding which is contextualized with bank asi) is also another term for the word ta'wil, especially when the hadith is related to the nature traditions.

2) Contextual-Local

However, not all contextually understood hadith are universal in their teachings. There are also local ones. For example, the Hadith about the Beard

عن ابن عمر رضي الله عنهما عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: «أَحْفُوا الشَّوَارِبَ وَأَعْفُوا اللَّحَى.»

Ibn 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) reported that the Prophet (ﷺ) said: “Trim the moustache and maintain the beard!”

In his explanation of the above hadith, Shuhudi says: “The Prophet's command is relevant to the Arabs, Pakistanis and others who are naturally endowed with luxuriant hair, including moustaches and beards. The level of

¹² Syuhudi Ismail, *Hadis Nabi yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual*. (Jakarta PT. Bulan Bintang, 2009). 9

¹³ Umar, 'REKONSTRUKSI PEMIKIRAN HERMENEUTIKA HADIS SYUHUDI ISMAIL'.

fertility and thickness of the Indonesian people is not the same as that of the Arabs. Many Indonesians have sparse mustaches and beards. Based on this fact, the hadith must be understood contextually. The content of the hadith is local.¹⁴

3) Contextual-Temporal

Hadiths that are understood contextually can also mean that their teachings are temporal. For example, a hadith that discusses the leadership of a woman.

عن أبي بَكْرَةَ رضي الله عنه قال: لقد نَفَعَنِي الله بكلمة سمعْتُها من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أَيَّامَ الجَمَلِ، بعد ما كُذِّتُ أَنْ أَلْحَقَ بِأَصْحَابِ الجَمَلِ فَأُقَاتِلَ معهم، قال: لَمَّا بَلَغَ رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أَنْ أَهْلَ قَارِسَ، قد مَلَكُوا عليهم بنتَ كِسْرَى، قال: «لَنْ يُفْلِحَ قومٌ وَلَوْ أُمِرَ هُمْ امْرَأَةً.»

Abu Bakrah (may Allah be pleased with him) reported: "Allah benefited me in the battle of Jamal with a sentence that I had heard from the Messenger of Allah (may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him) when I was about to join the camel riders and fight with them." He continued: "When it came to the attention of the Messenger of Allah (may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him) that the Persians were led by the daughter of Kisra, he said: 'There will be no success for a people who entrust their affairs to a woman.'"

Before expressing his opinion regarding the meaning of this Hadith, Syuhudi Ismail first explains the meaning conveyed by the majority of scholars who understand the Hadith textually. The next step is to explain the background of the circumstances and conditions when the Prophet delivered this Hadith, where women's status was far below that of men. Women were not involved at all in the management of society and the state. Islam came to change the fate of women. They were given rights, honors and obligations by Islam in accordance with their dignity as beings responsible in the presence of God, both towards themselves, family and society and the state.¹⁵

Conclusion: Hadiths that are understood contextually are universal, temporal and local. The character of the matan that can be understood contextually is usually expressed in symbolic forms, and tamsil (language).¹⁶

According to Syuhudi, the activity of researching matan and interpreting it is not an easy matter. There are many factors why this activity becomes very

¹⁴ Syuhudi Ismail, *Hadis Nabi yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual*. (Jakarta PT. Bulan Bintang, 2009). 69

¹⁵ Syuhudi Ismail, *Hadis Nabi yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual*. (Jakarta PT. Bulan Bintang, 2009). 66

¹⁶ Umar.

difficult to do. That is why the scholars, also quoted by Syuhudi Ismail, set some very strict conditions. This is because without fulfilling these conditions, the hadith tends to be misleading. Some of these requirements are [1] Having expertise in the field of hadith, [2] Having a broad knowledge of Islamic teachings, [3] Having done the activity of reading hadith.¹⁷

Gadamer's Hermeneutics

The concept of hermeneutics was pioneered by a 20th century philosopher named Hans Georg Gadamer. His ideas and thoughts have been scientifically described in his book entitled *Truth and Method*. Ridwan Muzir explained that his main work avoids hermeneutics from the biases of Cartesian-style objectivism. Cartesian objectivism lies in two key words, namely truth and method. That is, truth is something that, if obtained, cannot be doubted and must also reach the level of certainty such as mathematics.¹⁸

Gadamer's main theories of hermeneutics are interrelated with one another and can be summarized as follows:¹⁹

- a) The theory of awareness of influence by history, namely the understanding of an interpreter is influenced by certain hermeneutic situations that surround him, both in the form of tradition, culture and life experience. Therefore, an interpreter must be able to overcome his subjectivity when he interprets a text.
- b) Pre-understanding Theory is the interpreter's initial guess to interpret which is open to be criticized, rehabilitated and corrected by the interpreter himself so as to avoid misunderstanding the message of the text. Or in religious language, an interpreter must have *dzauq al-hasan* (good prejudice because he has a clean heart) so as to produce the perfection of pre-understanding.
- c) Hermeneutic Horizon and Circle Assimilation Theory, which is the process of combining the horizon of the text and the horizon of the reader. The reader's horizon only acts as a starting point in understanding the text, which is only an opinion or possibility that the text is talking about something. This starting point should not impose the will of the reader's intentions but it should help to

¹⁷ Khoiril Umam Addzaky, 'KRITIK HADIST PERSPEKTIF MUHAMMAD SYUHUDI ISMAIL', *Multidisciplinary Indonesian Center Journal (MICJO)* 1, no. 2 (30 April 2024): 887–96, <https://doi.org/10.62567/micjo.v1i2.94>.

¹⁸ Dian Risky Amalia et al., 'Hermeneutika Perspektif Gadamer dan Fazlur Rahman', *Al-Fathin: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra Arab* 3, no. 02 (3 March 2021): 183, <https://doi.org/10.32332/al-fathin.v3i02.2416>.

¹⁹ P'syatul Luthfi et al., 'Comparative Study of Hamka and Quraish Shihab's Interpretation: Application of Gadamer's Hermeneutics in Qs. Al-Maidah [5]: 51', *Journal of Islamic Civilization* 4, no. 2 (30 October 2022): 176–85, <https://doi.org/10.33086/jic.v4i2.3584>.

understand what the text actually means. So there is a meeting between the subjectivity of the reader and the objectivity of the text, where the objective meaning of the text is favored. This interaction is then called the hermeneutic circle.

d) The Application Theory is that the message of the text must be applied at the time of interpretation, not the literal meaning of the text but a meaning that is more meaningful than just the literal meaning.

From this point of departure we can know that everything should not be understood from the outward aspect of the text alone, but also dig deeper into the meanings contained therein (ma'na al-bâṭin).²⁰

Gadamer's Hermeneutics Review of Syuhudi Ismail's Concept of Hadith Contextualization

Based on the four theories of hermeneutics initiated by Gadamer, the concept of interpretation of hadith by Syuhudi Ismail has relevance especially in contextual interpretation such as when Syuhudi Ismail interprets the hadith about the threat to a painter in his book *Textual and Contextual Hadith of the Prophet*.

As in explaining the meaning of the hadith of the threat to a painter, the contextualization of the interpretation of the hadith by Syuhudi Ismail includes a socio-historical analysis or asbabul wurud of the hadith in which the hadith was delivered by the Prophet related to the Prophet's function as a Prophet in order to protect his people from falling into shirk. The factor of the Prophet's concern about the fall of the companions into shirk is none other than because at the time this hadith was delivered many of his people had just embraced Islam after previously being idolaters. So the Prophet forbade his people to paint or draw animate beings for fear of being worshiped. This prohibition was not only for painters, but there are traditions that explain the prohibition of displaying paintings. The condition of the Prophet's people at that time became the 'illat of the law which is the cause of the birth of a law. The explanation related to this is in line with the review of influence with History in Gadamer's hermeneutic review. In this case, Syuhudi Ismail and Gadamer have the same concept of interpreting the text, namely by presenting the context of the past in its interpretation and not only focusing on the past.

A further review of Gadamer's hermeneutics can be inferred from the analysis of the different conditions when the hadith was delivered and today

²⁰ Rohatun Nihayah, 'Kesetaraan Gender Melalui Pendekatan Hermeneutika Gadamer dalam Kajian Q.S. Al-Hujurat Ayat 13', *Syariati: Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an dan Hukum* 7, no. 2 (5 December 2021): 207–18, <https://doi.org/10.32699/syariati.v7i2.2112>.

where the majority of Muslims are no longer worried about falling into polytheism that the Prophet feared. The loss of the fear of falling into polytheism makes the loss of the legal 'illat' attached to the hadith so that as stated by Syuhudi Ismail, the hadith can be contextualized and characterized as a temporal hadith. The meaning of temporal is that the Hadith is applicable at the time when the 'illat' of the Hadith is still attached. The combination of the interpretive horizon and the existing text such as the interpretation done by Syuhudi Ismail has implications in the development of the meaning of the hadith so that it is not bound to the meaning of the text which when viewed from the aspect of context is no longer relevant,

When combined from the interpretation steps of Syuhudi Ismail which include aspects of pre-understanding, fusion of horizons or fusion of horizons of the interpreter and the text, the Hadith about the threat to painters was delivered by the Prophet when the condition of Muslims was still prone to falling into shirk by worshiping idols or statues. The prohibition conveyed by the Prophet certainly brought maslahat and aimed to save Muslims at that time from shirk. Muslims today are not worried about falling into shirk by worshiping statues or idols.

Conclusion

In the development of hadith scholarship, Syuhudi Ismail has an important role by contributing modern thoughts and theories such as the theory of contextualizing hadith by labeling hadith as temporal, local and universal. Syuhudi Ismail's attempt to contextually interpret hadith is similar to Gadamer's hermeneutic theory that to interpret a text presents the aspects of the past, the present context and pre-understanding of the interpreter.

References

- Addzaky, K. U. (2024). KRITIK HADIST PERSPEKTIF MUHAMMAD SYUHUDI ISMAIL. *Multidisciplinary Indonesian Center Journal (MICJO)*, 1(2), 887–896. <https://doi.org/10.62567/micjo.v1i2.94>
- Alkadri, A., Arifin, Z., & Anwar, H. (2023). Contextualization of Hadith about Tolerance for Religious and Cultural Diversity. *AL QUDS : Jurnal Studi Alquran Dan Hadis*, 7(1), 95. <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v7i1.5744>
- Al-Bukhari, Abu Abdillah Muhammad bin Ismail. Al Jami' al-Shahih, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut.
- Al-Qusyairi, Abu Husain Muslim bin al-Hajjaj. (1955M) Al Jami' al-Shahih (Shahih Muslim).
- Amalia, D. R., Pratiwi, W., Mushodiq, M. A., & Saifullah, M. (2021). Hermeneutik Perspektif Gadamer dan Fazlur Rahman. *Al-Fathin: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra Arab*, 3(02), 183. <https://doi.org/10.32332/al-fathin.v3i02.2416>
- Fithoroini, D., & Mukti, M. L. (2021). HADIS NABI YANG TEKSTUAL DAN KONTEKSTUAL. *NABAWI*, 2. <https://doi.org/10.55987/njhs.v2i1.42>
- Ismail, Syuhudi. (1995). Kaedah Kesahihan Sanad Hadis. PT. Bulan Bintang:Jakarta.
- Ismail, Syuhudi. (2009). Hadis Nabi yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual. PT. Bulan Bintang:Jakarta.
- Ismail, Syuhudi. (1992). Metodologi Penelitian Hadis. PT. Bulan Bintang:Jakarta.
- Kurniawan, M. I. R. (t.t.). *PENGAPLIKASIAN TEORI HERMENEUTIKA HANS-GEORG GADAMER TERHADAP HADIS NABI MUHAMMAD*.
- Luthfi, I., Raisa Zuhra Salsabila Awaluddin, Safri Nurjannah, & Moh. Isbat Alfani Ghoffari. (2022). Comparative Study of Hamka and Quraish Shihab's Interpretation: Application of Gadamer's Hermeneutics in Qs. Al-Maidah [5]: 51. *Journal of Islamic Civilization*, 4(2), 176–185. <https://doi.org/10.33086/jic.v4i2.3584>
- Nihayah, R. (2021). Kesetaraan Gender Melalui Pendekatan Hermeneutika Gadamer dalam Kajian Q.S. Al-Hujurat Ayat 13. *Syariat: Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an dan Hukum*, 7(2), 207–218. <https://doi.org/10.32699/syariat.v7i2.2112>
- Nur'aini, S. (2023). Pemikiran Syuhudi Ismail tentang Hadis Tekstual dan Kontekstual. *Cendekia Inovatif Dan Berbudaya*, 1(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.59996/cendib.v1i1.145>

- Pertiwi, K., & Wijaya Mulya, T. (2023). Mistresses, mothers, and headscarves: Media representations of women in corruption scandals in Indonesia. *Feminist Media Studies*, 23(5), 2135–2151. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14680777.2022.2042832>
- Rifai, S., Syafik R, Moh., & Masruhan, M. (2023). Analisis Pemikiran Hermeneutika Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail. *CENDEKIA: Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 8(2), 227–244. <https://doi.org/10.37348/cendekia.v8i2.210>
- Supena, I. (2022). Gadamer's Philosophical Hermeneutics on Religious Language and COVID-19. *Filosofija. Sociologija*, 33(3). <https://doi.org/10.6001/fil-soc.v33i3.4780>
- Suryani, S. (2022). Urgensi Hermeneutika Sebagai Metode Dalam Pemahaman Hadis. *AL QUDDS: Jurnal Studi Alquran dan Hadis*, 6(2), 779. <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v6i2.4086>
- Umar, U. H. (2022). REKONTRUKSI PEMIKIRAN HERMENEUTIKA HADIS SYUHUDI ISMAIL. *PAPPASANG*, 4(1), 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.46870/jiat.v4i1.166>