

# **Analysis of Educational Policy in the Framework of Learning Efficiency and Effectiveness**

**Mahrus**

State Islamic University of Syarif Hidayatullah, Indonesia  
mahruus23@gmail.com

**Suud Sarim Karimullah**

Gümüşhane University, Türkiye  
Suudsarimkarimullah@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

This study aims to reveal how the policy-making process carried out by SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati Bekasi, starting from the formulation, and implementation, to policy evaluation, which will end in the value of effectiveness and efficiency as a form of institution existence. This study uses qualitative research through descriptive analysis methods with data collection models using interviews, documentation, observations, and triangulation of sources, techniques, and theories. Through this method, researchers get a finding containing policy cases from two institutions related to the similarities and differences between the formulation process and effectiveness and efficiency. In the formulation process, both have different policies between online and offline, but in the formulation, each has weaknesses consisting of flaws in analysis and alternatives. Meanwhile, in terms of implementation, there are obstacles, individually and institutionally, composed of weak motivation and the disintegration of some teachers and staff. The evaluation has similarities in the implementation system, namely, using a formative, summative model. In terms of effectiveness and efficiency, both achieved the same value. Namely, they were both able to graduate students of 30 Juz Qur'an, while inefficiency there were shortcomings in financing and dependence on electricity in the teaching and learning process.

Keywords: Policy, Education, Effectiveness, Efficiency

## Introduction

Education policy is urgent in an institution for effective and efficient continuity of teaching and learning activities effectively and efficiently, especially during the COVID-19 pandemic. An institutional leader must be selective and able to read the situation or circumstances to provide institutional policies so that the policies provided are not only enjoyed by a few people and become a disaster for others. The policy, which is the primary milestone in strengthening the existence of an institution or organization, has two views, namely, an etymological view and a terminology view. The etymological perspective is that policy was initially taken from the Greek, derived from the word 'Polis,' which means city.<sup>1</sup> Others explain that policy comes from the English language, namely from the word 'policy,' which means dealing with problems of a general nature and emphasizes action.<sup>2</sup> The birth of an understanding of policies from various languages has created many perspectives from policy experts according to the language they see.

Understanding of policy in terms of terminology is the development of knowledge of etymology, understanding of terminology can be seen from several opinions of policy experts, as stated by Abidin that policy is a general government decision and must be obeyed by all members of the community.<sup>3</sup> At this time, it is an opportunity for policymakers in school institutions to provide policies autonomously to create an effective and efficient teaching and learning process because autonomous education management has been implemented since the collapse of the new order, namely, the central government began to launch to make regulations related to autonomy. Primary area of education management. As stated in Law Number 22 of 1999 concerning Regional Autonomy and Law Number 25 concerning Balance of Central and Regional Money. In the regulation, there is an expression that the management of education is decentralized and actively involves the community.

---

<sup>1</sup> Syafaruddin, *Efektivitas Kebijakan Pendidikan* (Jakarta: Penerbit Rineka Cipta, 2008), 75.

<sup>2</sup> Geoff Whitty, "Education (Al) Research and Education Policy Making: Is Conflict Inevitable?," *British educational research journal* 32, no. 2 (2006): 159–176; Abdul Majid, *Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan*, ed. Alviana Cahyanti (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Samudra Biru, 2018); Jenny Ozga and Bob Lingard, "Globalisation, Education Policy and Politics," in *The RoutledgeFalmer Reader in Education Policy and Politics* (Routledge, 2007), 75–92.

<sup>3</sup> Sardjana Orba Manullang, Mardani Mardani, and Aslan Aslan, "The Effectiveness of Al-Quran Memorization Methods for Millennials Santri During Covid-19 in Indonesia," *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (2021): 195–207; Syafaruddin, *Efektivitas Kebijakan Pendidikan*; Arjun S Bedi and Ashish Garg, "The Effectiveness of Private versus Public Schools: The Case of Indonesia," *Journal of Development Economics* 61, no. 2 (2000): 463–494.

Legality related to the decentralization of education management has been strengthened and formulated from year to year as stated in Law Number 32 of 2004, chapter 1, article 1, that government authority is delegated by the government to autonomy to regulate and manage government affairs based on the Unitary State system The Republic of Indonesia. The main components of the policy consist of 1) policy formulation, 2) policy implementation, 3) monitoring policy implementation, and 4) policy evaluation. Policy formulation is a series of activities to collect information for analysis and develop several alternatives to solve problems as a decision.

Policy formulation is the thing that determines the progress and setbacks of educational institutions in the future. Therefore, policy formulation should not be done haphazardly. In line with Winarno's expression that policy formulation is one of the crucial stages in policy, many policymakers fail to solve the problems they face.<sup>4</sup> Formulating a good policy consists of several things, which include: 1) goal formulation, 2) problem identification, 3) agenda setting, 4) looking for alternatives according to their respective consequences, and 5) decision making, which will later become the rules and guidelines<sup>5</sup>. The next step is policy implementation, where the implementation of this policy is an implementation process to achieve the goals of the procedure itself. Policy implementation, in principle, is a way to achieve goals.

According to Van Meter, quoted by M. Solichin, that policy implementation is all activities carried out by individuals, community groups, the state, or the private sector to achieve a policy goal by a predetermined policy.<sup>6</sup> The policy implementation model is based on Edward's theory and analyzes the handling of education policy; there are four variables: 1) bureaucratic structure, 2) communication, 3) resources, and 4) attitude.<sup>7</sup> There are three main pillars in the efforts to facilitate the implementation of policies: 1) organizing, which is related to the arrangement of resources, units, and methods to achieve goals, 2) interpretation, relating to the interpretation of policies so that they are correctly understood, accepted, and implemented by all organizational members, 3)

---

<sup>4</sup> Andi Misna, "Formulasi Kebijakan Alokasi Dana Desa Di Desa Kandolo Kecamatan Teluk Pandan Kabupaten Kutai Timur," *Jurnal Administrasi Negara* 3, no. 2 (2015): 521–533.

<sup>5</sup> Goddey Wilson and Alafuro Epelle, "Public Policy Formulation and Implementation in Contemporary Nigeria," *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences* 8, no. 6 (2018): 175–185.

<sup>6</sup> Mujianto Solichin, "Implementasi Kebijakan Pendidikan Dan Peran Birokrasi," *Religi: Jurnal Studi Islam* 6, no. 2 (2015): 148–178.

<sup>7</sup> Sitti Aminah et al., "The Barriers of Policy Implementation of Handling Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia.," *European Journal of Molecular and Clinical Medicine* 8, no. 1 (2021): 1222–1242.

application, which is related to the consistency of the institution in providing equipment, services, and payments by the program agreement <sup>8</sup>.

This is done to facilitate the implementation of the central policies in the education sector so that the learning process and educational goals are not static and always bring about change. This effort is supported by Wunong Zhang's statement regarding the implementation of education policies during the pandemic in China that in implementing the procedure, there is the following steps:<sup>9</sup> 1) Integration, 2) providing training, 3) seeing the possibilities contained in online lessons, 4) formulating guidelines as a transition from online to offline, 5) draw up plans related to learning programs after the pandemic.

Implementation activities are also accompanied by monitoring activities, which function as an implementation controller. Monitoring is understood as a monitoring activity carried out between the implementation and policy evaluation stages to find various problems in the activity process and correct the errors encountered. Monitoring is the process of observing activities while the program is in progress, as well as an effort to convert various kinds of mistakes to complete the program correctly and adequately until the end of the activity <sup>10</sup>.

Monitoring itself is divided into two parts, which include 1) Monitoring from the process aspect, which is carried out to monitor activity and whether the work process has been carried out correctly or not. 2) monitoring from the aspect of results, which is carried out to observe the progress of the planned program results.<sup>11</sup> The monitoring process includes three stages: 1) setting implementation standards, 2) measuring implementation and 3) determining the deviation between implementation and plan standards.<sup>12</sup> The final step in a policy is policy evaluation. Policy evaluation can see the advantages and disadvantages of a predetermined procedure. As stated by Rijal Firdaos and Ahmad,

---

<sup>8</sup> Harry Firman and Burhanuddin Tola, "The Future of Schooling in Indonesia," *Journal of International Cooperation in Education* 11, no. 1 (2008): 71–84; Solichin, "Implementasi Kebijakan Pendidikan Dan Peran Birokrasi"; Anita Lie, "Education Policy and EFL Curriculum in Indonesia: Between the Commitment to Competence and the Quest for Higher Test Scores," *TEFLIN journal* 18, no. 1 (2007): 1–15.

<sup>9</sup> Wunong Zhang et al., "Suspending Classes without Stopping Learning: China's Education Emergency Management Policy in the COVID-19 Outbreak," *Journal of Risk and Financial Management* (MDPI, 2020).

<sup>10</sup> Daniella Tilbury, "Monitoring and Evaluation during the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development," *Journal of Education for Sustainable Development* 1, no. 2 (2007): 239–254; Prijambodo, *Monitoring Dan Evaluasi* (Bogor: PT. Penerbit IPB Press, 2014); Daniel A Wagner et al., "Monitoring and Evaluation of ICT in Education Projects. A Handbook for Developing Countries" (2005).

<sup>11</sup> Prijambodo, *Monitoring Dan Evaluasi*.

<sup>12</sup> Sunarno Sastro Atmodjo, *Pengembangan SDM* (Bandung: CV. Media Sains Indonesia, 2021).

evaluation can provide information related to policy achievement and as an administrative tool for policymakers.<sup>13</sup> Policy evaluation is a tool for broadly assessing the effectiveness of a country's program or organization consisting of two or more variables that have a relative level of energy.<sup>14</sup>

After the evaluation process is carried out correctly, the policymakers will understand the level of effectiveness and efficiency. Effectiveness and efficiency are related to the accuracy of the budget, time, and targets. Talking about effectiveness and efficiency, education and financing are two components that cannot be separated because education cannot run without funding, and funding can support the education process.<sup>15</sup> Therefore, discussing costs and time are necessary to discuss the concepts of effectiveness and efficiency. The indicators of learning effectiveness and efficiency consist of attitude, ability to understand learning, perseverance, opportunity, and quality of education.

In this study, researchers will examine how school principals make policies regarding the formulation, implementation, and evaluation of policies and policy outcomes in the context of the effectiveness and efficiency of the learning process during the COVID-19 pandemic at SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati Bekasi for the existence of the institution, because in reality, many formal institutions have stalled due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Furthermore, the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on education in the teaching and learning process affects students' knowledge, emotions, ethics, and morality because the learning system implemented at the beginning of 2020 has made students unable to absorb subjects as a whole to communicate well with friends and teachers perfectly, the social distance between them became increasingly tenuous.

---

<sup>13</sup> Rijal Firdaos and Ahmad Ahmad, "The Implementation of National Examination as The Direction of National Education Policy," *Al-Tadzkiyyah: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 1 (2018): 135–151.

<sup>14</sup> Sholehuddin, *Pendidikan Islam Di Kota Metropolitan* (Malang: PT. Cinta Intan Selaras, 2020); Christoph Dann, Gerhard Neumann, and Jan Peters, "Policy Evaluation with Temporal Differences: A Survey and Comparison," *Journal of Machine Learning Research* 15 (2014): 809–883; Susan Athey and Guido W Imbens, "The State of Applied Econometrics: Causality and Policy Evaluation," *Journal of Economic perspectives* 31, no. 2 (2017): 3–32.

<sup>15</sup> Virza Alamsyah, "A Literature Review of Financing the Tertiary Education In Indonesia," *International Journal of Social, Policy and Law* 1, no. 1 (2020); Birutė Pranevičienė and Aurelija Pūraitė, "The Financing Methods of Higher Education System," *Jurisprudencija* 122, no. 4 (2010): 335–356.

## **Research Methods**

This study uses qualitative research with a descriptive analysis method, which seeks comprehensive and in-depth information with a focus on research on educational institutions at SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati Bekasi related to the analysis of educational policies related to learning in which there are formulations, implementations, evaluation, effectiveness and efficiency of learning taken so that educational institutions continue to exist during the covid-19 pandemic. While the data collection model uses interviews, documentation, and observations to ensure the data is valid, researchers use triangulation of sources, methods, and theories.

## **Results and Discussions**

The policies of SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati Bekasi to establish effectiveness and efficiency during the COVID-19 pandemic have different policies. SMPS-IT with the approach of Supplementing the Special Conditions Curriculum and offline SMAS-IT, which are set to start the 2020/2021 school year, considering that it can stabilize the institution's condition, *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I. said the policies taken by the SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati are based on the formulation, implementation, and evaluation stages.

## **Policy Formulation**

The formulation is the initial stage of the policy. The formulation of the policies passed by the SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati can be seen as follows:

### **1. Team formation**

Based on the information of *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I. in determining curriculum supplement policies special conditions, "The SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati did not form a special team in determining policies, only the SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati empowered the existing structures, such as involving teachers, homeroom teachers, organizers of administrative activities and educational information (TU), the student section, guidance and counseling services (BK), stakeholders and others, because the policies taken follow the directions from the center. "Likewise, the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, "They did not form a special team, only empowered existing structures, from teachers to principals. We take advantage of the existing state of the structure by conducting coordination

meetings related to education policies in the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati environment."

## 2. Information gathering

The collection of information on SMPS-IT Muslimah True, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S.Pd.I, SMPS-IT Muslimah true only uses improvised media, such as online and print media, because the institution does not accommodate much information related to educational policies in the school environment; apart from that, the education policy at SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati follows centrally determined guidelines. It's just that the SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati sees internal and external strengths in its operation. Therefore, collecting information on SMAS-IT institutions can be done in several ways, including using a variety of verbal, letters, print media, online media, and so on.

The information gathering stage carried out by the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, was to adopt notification letters from the relevant agencies, information from supervisors, builders, and private school communication forums (FKSS), in addition to From that, the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati held a coordination meeting from all levels of the leadership of each unit, this was done to obtain information that both subordinates and supervisors could utilize.

## 3. Information analysis

After some information is entered into the institution, the next step is to analyze the data to select more accurate and relevant information to be used as a policy. The SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati does not review various information in determining policies because the learning system policy adheres to the learning system that the minister of education has implemented; it's the SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati examines the internal and external conditions of educational institutions in applying central policies. As stated by *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I, that "The policy-making process carried out by true Muslim women, namely conducting internal and external studies to enforce central policies as well as anticipating and preventing the transmission of covid-19, but the teaching-learning process continues to run well, such as considering various places of activity to be carried out".

Meanwhile, the analysis conducted by SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S.Pd.I, MM, is "trying to present all the information obtained

both through online media and other media. After being presented carefully, then we reduce it and draw conclusions". On the other hand, Ustadzah Hamidah, S.Pd.I, MM, said that before the information was obtained and analyzed, his party first made a formulation that would later become a solution. The formulations are: 1) how is learning at SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati? 2) Is face-to-face learning allowed during a pandemic like this? 3) Have you reported to the appropriate office or supervisor about learning at SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati?

#### 4. Provide alternatives

The formulation is the first step of policy-making, must also be considered carefully, and look for several alternative policies to avoid failure. For example, *Ustadz* Mufid, S.Pd.I, revealed that "in this policy, there is no alternative prepared by the institution, but the institution is trying to develop this policy so that the learning process continues to run effectively."

*Ustadzah* Selly Gita, S.Pd, said almost the same thing as *Ustadz* Mufid: "that there is no other alternative than the online learning system or what is called a special needs curriculum supplement." While the alternative for making SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati is based on the explanation of *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S.Pd.I, MM that in "the design of the learning system there is no alternative provided, because SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati must implement face-to-face learning, which previously did online learning, but this gave rise to a lot of downturns until in the end, we had to return to offline (face-to-face) learning."

#### 5. Operating budget

Every policy must have a budget that will be able to smooth the pace of the procedure itself because, with a sufficient budget and funds, policies can be achieved. For example, the budget for SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati during the COVID-19 pandemic, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S.Pd.I, "Until now, we have not made a budget, related to SMPS-IT still using the previous budget, because the facilities at the institution are still sufficient, but it is possible that at the beginning of the new school year we will develop both from in terms of budget and others in order to achieve learning effectiveness. The SMAS-IT budget is based on the explanation of *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S.Pd.I, MM that "for the operation of the learning system during the Covid-19 period, we did not add a budget, because the learning system is still the



same as a typical day, it's just that we reduced the meeting hours which were previously 45 minutes turn into 30 minutes.

### **Policy Implementation of SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati**

Implementation of a policy is vital because, without commission, a policy design will only be a pile of paper that will never be achieved. Policy implementation is all activities carried out by individuals, community groups, the state, or the private sector to achieve a policy goal by a predetermined policy. For example, the implementation of the procedures carried out by SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati is as follows:

#### **1. Executor**

Determining the implementing actors in a policy is also urgent because, without actors, the policy will be empty. As for the actors or policy implementers, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I. are all school residents, including students, security guards, and janitors, who are always provided with hand sanitizers and hand washing stations in various corners.

Based on the implementation schedule, there are several implementing teams: schools, boarding schools, infrastructure, and security. For example, *Ustadzah* Rini Aprianti, S. Pd, stated that "as a teaching staff I am also involved in implementing this policy, but the implementation of the teaching and learning process is through zoom media. So every teacher is not allowed to enter the classroom, it's just that the school provides the necessary facilities, such as computers and projectors, screens and others". The policy implementation team at SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, is "every school member, including the principal, deputy head of student affairs, and homeroom teacher."

The essence of a policy is to know who is the implementer and who will implement the procedure itself because a policy without an implementer is just a pile of ideas and paper. Based on the explanation above shows that the implementer of the policy has been determined based on the structure and parts that have been selected.

#### **2. Socialization**

The policy socialization process carried out by SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadz* Mufid S. Pd.I, "takes the form of a meeting after the policy is set, and also carries out an assimilation process to each party, especially for teachers

in order to apply the media used. In addition, the principal as a policy maker always tries to convey related matters and the objectives of the policy through open meetings".

The above statement is in line with the idea of Djulaeha, S. Pd, that "every school member, including himself, also follows the various directions conveyed by the principal, especially with regard to the media that will be used in the teaching and learning process." The socialization process carried out by the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, "is through circulars and verbal notifications to all school members, especially homeroom teachers and teachers." Even though SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati conducts the teaching and learning process, as usual, namely the offline teaching and learning process (face to face), according to Rowinda Kurniawati, S. Pd, "the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati also conducts socialization, because the teaching and learning process must comply with protocols. health and reducing study hours from 45 minutes per meeting to 30 minutes, while the socialization process is an open meeting with all school members."

### 3. Organizing

The organizing step is also urgent too because it is related by grouping the main tasks assigned to each individual or group. The organizing effort can be in the form of handing over the functions or authority of the organizational group or the allocation of existing resources. *Ustadzah* Selly Gita explained that "the organizational effort made by the principal is by giving full authority to each policy implementing coordinator consisting of the vice head of student affairs, vice principal of curriculum, homeroom teacher, head of the computer lab including me as a homeroom teacher." The organizational process carried out by SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, "is to create a Covid-19 task force at the high school level. The organizing process is based on meetings with all groups, the teacher council, and staff.

Meetings are held to form a command, the value of integrity, understanding of the primary duties and functions, and authority". *Ustadzah* Nursubiyati, S. Pd said that "the organizational process carried out by the school principal is the granting of authority to certain parties based on their respective main tasks, if like me it is related to how to describe the curriculum and regulate administrative patterns and others."

#### 4. Media

Media in implementing policies is also an essential part of implementing procedures because, without adequate media and facilities, it will impact the effectiveness or efficiency of the policy. According to *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd, the media used in implementing the policy "in the form of sound systems, projectors, computers, data packages, and wifi. The application is in the form of zoom because the zoom application is an application that is very easy to learn and apply." This expression is supported by findings with the results of documentation obtained in the teaching and learning process. The media used in implementing policies at SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, is "improvised media, including laptops, in focus in every classroom, blackboards, and others. Meanwhile, the media to prevent the transmission of COVID-19 is to provide a place to wash hands, hand sanitizer, social distance, and wear masks.

#### **Policy Evaluation**

Policy evaluation is the final step in policy implementation to see the effectiveness and efficiency of the policies that have been set and the supporting and inhibiting factors. Policy evaluation is an examination, rating, and assessment tool to analyze policy results. The stages and models of policy evaluation can be described from each institution for both SMPS-IT and SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati. The following evaluation process is carried out:

##### 1. Stages

One of the evaluation programs is to design the stages that will be carried out in the evaluation process. The steps carried out by the SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I, are collecting information, processing information, and drawing conclusions. We can cache data from daily, weekly, and quarterly reports, which will be finalized through plenary meetings.

Another opinion that is in line with the above expression is the statement of Djulaeha, S.Pd, that "She was asked to make a report regarding the policy of the learning system that was already taking place, and sometimes the school principal monitored himself regarding activities in the office because even though they were online, every teacher and staff required to work."

The evaluation stages designed by the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, consist of the stages of preparation, implementation, processing results, and conclusions. The preparation stage asks each staff or teacher to record all the activities mandated according to their respective jobs. The implementation stage is carried out after the preparation stage; the implementation stage here can be formal or informal. Finally, the information processing stage is carried out to see the constraints that must be resolved and the strengths that must be developed. While the conclusion is made after processing the information, it is done to make an accurate decision by the demands of the times. The implementation system is carried out four times a year, which consists of the first mid-semester assessment (PTS-1), second mid-semester assessment (PTS-2), first semester, and second semester.

Some of the information above explains that the stages of policy implementation consist of various stages, including technical and implementation. For example, conduct audits of multiple programs, allow time to design what will be reported, and determine implementation times. While the performance can be in the form of verbal or written reports and also draw conclusions from the various information presented.

## 2. Model and Approach

The model in evaluation is a description of a style from beginning to end to assess the results of a policy. The application of the policy evaluation model, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I provide an assessment starting from the process and results. Because this will direct policymakers to determine how the policy is running, whether it is as expected or not. While the evaluation model carried out by SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, uses a formative, summative evaluation model. This means that the form of evaluation can be formal and informal.

## 3. Gap

Gaps are imbalances in an activity or policy between two parties. The gap is based on the policy evaluation results, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I, is a monitoring and assimilation process that takes a lot of time because some teachers and staff still do not understand the tasks given.

Another explanation says that the gap is based on policy evaluation; according to *Ustadzah* Rini Aprianti, S.Pd., "Difficulty in making a report regarding active students or not, mapping for students who understand and do not understand, and media errors occur during the teaching and learning process." Meanwhile, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM, the gaps that exist in SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati based on the evaluation results consist of economic constraints and technical constraints. For example, the financial condition is that all activities are suspended on the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, which are not supported by the smooth payment of Educational Guidance Contributions (SPP), which are found in cases of arrears of guardians of students and installment payments of Educational Guidance Contributions (SPP). Meanwhile, technically it is difficult to manage time because there is a cut in the teaching and learning process or other activities to prevent the transmission of COVID-19.

Effectiveness and efficiency are intertwined in the idea of education policy; if one of the two is injured, then it is a sign that the policies taken are not appropriate, meaning that there is information on time and funding to achieve educational goals. Therefore, the effectiveness and efficiency of the education policies of the two institutions can be seen as follows:

a. Student Achievement

The success of educational policies, or in other words, effectiveness and efficiency, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S. Pd.I, can be seen from the output issued by the institution, especially the ability of students from various knowledge and skills. The achievements obtained by SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati consist of multiple branches, including the majority of students getting scores above the minimum standard of completeness criteria (KKM) as described above, being able to speak English and Arabic, and being able to memorize 30 Qur'an. juz with modest advice allowances.

b. Institutional Achievements

The institution's achievement is a success in carrying out various programs that have been planned, including the teaching and learning process, graduation, and others. The achievements of the SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadz* Mufid, S.Pd.I, are according to the big agenda, namely being

able to carry out the teaching and learning process optimally and graduate students during the Covid-19 period without having to add or cut the previous budget.

The achievements of the SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati during the COVID-19 pandemic, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S.Pd.I, MM, was "being able to carry out the face-to-face teaching and learning process even though they had to cut the face-to-face time from 45 minutes to 30 minutes." minutes and maintain health protocols. In addition, it can also lead students to participate in the graduation process as many as 30 juz, and keep the institution's existence".

*Ustadzah* Nursubiyati, S. Pd said that "the institution's achievements during the covid-19 pandemic are being able to integrate every element of the school community consisting of staff, teachers, and students, being able to carry out programs that have been designed, and being able to lead students to show the outside world through seminars. virtual". Meanwhile, the need for facilities at SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati, according to *Ustadzah* Hamidah, S. Pd.I, MM "consists of two parts, although implementing the face-to-face teaching and learning process, in reality, they must follow the directions of health protocols. Therefore, first is the need for facilities for the teaching and learning process as usual, and second is the need for facilities in following the directions of health protocols such as disinfectants, masks, and face shields".

## **Conclusion**

In formulation, SMPS-IT Muslimah Sejati institutions have a weakness in providing alternative policies because all policies are determined based on an appeal from central regulations, meaning that they are not relevant to the theory of policy formulation because when this policy is out of sync with the middle of the journey, it will have a fatal impact on the existence of the institution. Meanwhile, SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati has limitations in gathering information and determining budgets because they assume that the current learning system will not find problems.

At the implementation stage, in practice, some teachers disintegrated and had weak motivation, although the teaching-learning process continued. There is a dependence on electricity which results in a smooth learning process. However, there are still efforts to deal with the case and how to solve it, such as assimilation and doctrinal

forms to keep one goal in mind, as well as designing a way to not depend on electricity. SMAS-IT Muslimah Sejati also experienced egocentricity from some teachers and weak motivation from some students because they were jealous of institutions outside the SMAS-IT institution. As for how to handle it in the form of monitoring and encouraging all students. While in the evaluation process, there are similarities in models and approaches, although they have differences in policy-making, which are more dominant in the formative, summative evaluation model because, with this model, the control method is more effective, while the approach uses a quasi-evaluation system where the evaluator does not have to check formally. The level of policy effectiveness is illustrated by the implementation of each program and the fulfillment of minimum completeness criteria (KKM) by students. However, there are still shortcomings because facilities have not been fulfilled, and there is a lack of financing.

## References

- Abdul Majid. *Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan*. Edited by Alviana Cahyanti. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Samudra Biru, 2018.
- Alamsyah, Virza. "A Literature Review of Financing the Tertiary Education In Indonesia." *International Journal of Social, Policy and Law* 1, no. 1 (2020).
- Aminah, Sitti, Hotnir Sipahutar, H S Tomo, Tini Apriani, Siti Maemunah, Agustinus Hartopo, and Muhamad Ismail. "The Barriers of Policy Implementation of Handling Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia." *European Journal of Molecular and Clinical Medicine* 8, no. 1 (2021): 1222–1242.
- Athey, Susan, and Guido W Imbens. "The State of Applied Econometrics: Causality and Policy Evaluation." *Journal of Economic perspectives* 31, no. 2 (2017): 3–32.
- Bedi, Arjun S, and Ashish Garg. "The Effectiveness of Private versus Public Schools: The Case of Indonesia." *Journal of Development Economics* 61, no. 2 (2000): 463–494.
- Dann, Christoph, Gerhard Neumann, and Jan Peters. "Policy Evaluation with Temporal Differences: A Survey and Comparison." *Journal of Machine Learning Research* 15 (2014): 809–883.
- Firdaos, Rijal, and Ahmad Ahmad. "The Implementation of National Examination as The Direction of National Education Policy." *Al-Tadzkiyyah: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 1 (2018): 135–151.
- Firman, Harry, and Burhanuddin Tola. "The Future of Schooling in Indonesia." *Journal of International Cooperation in Education* 11, no. 1 (2008): 71–84.
- Lie, Anita. "Education Policy and EFL Curriculum in Indonesia: Between the Commitment to Competence and the Quest for Higher Test Scores." *TEFLIN journal* 18, no. 1 (2007): 1–15.
- Manullang, Sardjana Orba, Mardani Mardani, and Aslan Aslan. "The Effectiveness of Al-Quran Memorization Methods for Millennials Santri During Covid-19 in Indonesia." *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (2021): 195–207.
- Misna, Andi. "Formulasi Kebijakan Alokasi Dana Desa Di Desa Kandolo Kecamatan Teluk Pandan Kabupaten Kutai Timur." *Jurnal Administrasi Negara* 3, no. 2 (2015): 521–533.
- Ozga, Jenny, and Bob Lingard. "Globalisation, Education Policy and Politics." In *The RoutledgeFalmer Reader in Education Policy and Politics*, 75–92. Routledge, 2007.
- Pranevičienė, Birutė, and Aurelija Pūraitė. "The Financing Methods of Higher Education System." *Jurisprudencija* 122, no. 4 (2010): 335–356.
- Prijambodo. *Monitoring Dan Evaluasi*. Bogor: PT. Penerbit IPB Press, 2014.
- Sholehuddin. *Pendidikan Islam Di Kota Metropolitan*. Malang: PT. Cinta Intan Selaras, 2020.
- Solichin, Mujianto. "Implementasi Kebijakan Pendidikan Dan Peran Birokrasi." *Religi: Jurnal Studi Islam* 6, no. 2 (2015): 148–178.
- Sunarno Sastro Atmodjo. *Pengembangan SDM*. Bandung: CV. Media Sains Indonesia, 2021.



- Syafaruddin. *Efektivitas Kebijakan Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Penerbit Rineka Cipta, 2008.
- Tilbury, Daniella. "Monitoring and Evaluation during the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development." *Journal of Education for Sustainable Development* 1, no. 2 (2007): 239–254.
- Wagner, Daniel A, Bob Day, Tina James, Robert B Kozma, Jonathan Miller, and Tim Unwin. "Monitoring and Evaluation of ICT in Education Projects. A Handbook for Developing Countries" (2005).
- Whitty, Geoff. "Education (AI) Research and Education Policy Making: Is Conflict Inevitable?" *British educational research journal* 32, no. 2 (2006): 159–176.
- Wilson, Goddey, and Alafuro Epelle. "Public Policy Formulation and Implementation in Contemporary Nigeria." *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences* 8, no. 6 (2018): 175–185.
- Zhang, Wunong, Yuxin Wang, Lili Yang, and Chuanyi Wang. "Suspending Classes without Stopping Learning: China's Education Emergency Management Policy in the COVID-19 Outbreak." *Journal of Risk and Financial Management*. MDPI, 2020.